

THE ELEMENTARY ENGLISH REVIEW

VOLUME IV

FEBRUARY 1927

No. 2

DUPLICATE MATERIALS IN ELEMENTARY READERS

A Check List Compiled from Fourteen Series—Grades Three to Eight*

DELIA E. KIBBE

In Collaboration with Wisconsin Supervising Teachers

Origin of the Check List

THE SUPERVISING TEACHERS of Wisconsin are frequently confronted with the problem of suggesting the supplementary reading books to be provided for a given school or grade. This problem is one often met by supervisors and superintendents of all school systems. During the latter part of the school year 1925-26 a group of Wisconsin supervisors undertook the work of tabulating the subject material of a number of reading series in an effort to supply data for selection of texts for the reading classes under their supervision.

Each supervisor listed the stories and poems found in one series of readers. The data was placed on three by five library cards for convenience in alphabetizing the reading lists from all books examined. The name of the story, the author and the grade of the book were listed. The cards furnished by each supervisor were sent to this office (The Department of Public Instruction, Madison, Wisconsin), where they were arranged in alphabetical order according to titles and all duplications were recorded with the results given here. Some three or four series

not represented in the list were assigned to supervisors who, for various reasons, failed to complete the work; therefore, the data for these books does not appear in the final tabulation. Fourteen series, covering grades three to eight, are presented in this tabulation.

Use

This summary may assist in selecting supplementary reading material, for it indicates the duplication of subject matter found in any of these readers. It also shows the range of placement by grades. For illustration, it may be noted that the Arabian Nights Tales may be found in books designed for third grade or seventh grade children; Longfellow's "Daybreak" in the fourth grade or in the eighth grade. Many like variances in placement may be found.

This tabulation may be helpful to teachers by assisting them to locate more material along the line of any one subject. If the children are interested in reading stories of Daniel Boone, Abraham Lincoln, Theodore Roosevelt; or, if more stories of Thanksgiving Day are desired, these stories may be quickly located by reference to this list. It will be found most useful in schools where the reading material is not completely catalogued.

* Issued by the Department of Public Instruction, Madison, Wisconsin, 1926.

It is possible to base interesting comparative studies upon the list. For example, if a teacher is asked to give his opinion of the Bolenius Readers, he could run through the list, checking all titles followed by "A", the symbol for the Bolenius series. He would then continue his study, by noting, first, the character of the selections that appear in the series. He might study these checked titles in relation to certain scientific investigations which have been made, as for example, those by Miss McIntosh, and Miss Garnett, which appeared in Volume I of THE ELEMENTARY ENGLISH REVIEW, Mrs. Huber's study, described in Volume III of THE REVIEW, and the Winnetka Graded Book List, the list by Terman and Lima, and other available sources of information which might be helpful in determining the suitability of the selections for the course in reading.

The teacher might then go through the list, noting unchecked titles which in his judgment should have appeared. These omissions could be studied both from the standpoint of the published investigations, and from that of the unchecked titles on this tabulation.

When the teacher has completed to his satisfaction the study of materials represented in the series, and has also considered any conspicuous or important omissions, his third step might be an analysis of grade placements. This could be done by making notes on striking variations in placement of titles between the series in hand, and other series tabulated, and furthermore, by comparing the placement of titles in the series he is investigating with the placement given in the printed reports of scientific investigations.

After making a study of selections represented, and their grade placement in the series, the teacher could plan classroom experiments to test the appropriateness of some of the selections represented, and their suitability for the grades designated.

It is of course obvious that any series of readers not represented in the tabulation may be studied in relation to the fourteen series that are given here. In making the study, the teacher would select any volume, as for example the book for the fifth grade, and check the table of contents of the book against the titles in this list. In doing this he would take care to underline, in the table of contents, titles which do not appear in the tabulation, and check on the tabulation all titles duplicated in the book.

It must be kept in mind that this tabulation represents duplicated materials only. It is not a complete table of contents for the series treated.

Interpretation

The letters used in the summary indicate the series in which the selections occur; the figures show in which grades of the series the selection is to be found. Thus: it is indicated that *America*, by Lanier, occurs in B3; K5, that is, in the third grade book of the Bobbs Merrill Readers, and in the fifth grade of the Story Hour Readers.

The key to the tabulations follows.

KEY TO TABULATIONS

Key	Publication
A.....	Bolenius, Houghton Mifflin Co.
B.....	Bobbs Merrill, Bobbs Merrill Co.
C.....	Every Day Classics, Macmillan Co.
D.....	Elson Child Library Hour, Scott Foresman Co.
E.....	Field, Ginn and Co.
F....	Free and Treadwell, Row, Peterson and Co.
G.....	Lewis and Rowland, Winston Co.
H.....	Lincoln Reader, Laurel Co.
I.....	New Barnes, Laidlaw
J.....	Reading and Living, Scribners
K.....	Story Hour Reader, American Book Co.
L.....	Studies in Reading, Univ. Publishing Co.
M.....	Winston Reader, Winston Co.
N.....	Young and Field, Ginn and Co.

TITLES

- Abou Ben Adhem—Hunt. C5; F7; H7; I8; K6; M5; N6
 Actor and the Pig, The—Phaedrus. A6; B6
 Adams, John—Webster. C6; K8; L7
 Adventure of the Mason, The—Irrving. B6; M4
 America—Smith. B8; C3; N4

- America—Lanier. B3; K5
 American Flag, The—Drake. B7; C7; F7
 America for Me—Van Dyke. B7; I6; K7
 American Boy, The—Roosevelt. B7; J8
 American's Creed, The—Page. I6; K8.
 American Indian, The—Higginson. H5; M4
 America The Beautiful—Bates. B7; H6; I7; K7
 Andersen, Hans (Stories of). E4; K8; M4
 Androcles and the Lion. B3; D5
 Answer to a Child's Question—Coleridge. F3;
 L5; N3
 Alfred the Great. H5; M5
 Apples of Idun, The. B6; F4; N3
 Apple Orchard in the Spring, An—Martia. B5;
 F5; M4
 Arabian Night Tales. A3; C4,5; F3; H6,7; K3;
 L5; M4,5; N5
 Archery Contest, The—Scott. C5; K6
 Arrow and the Song, The—Longfellow. B7; F4;
 K4
 Arthur (King). C6; F6; M5; N5
 Autumn—Dickinson. A5; K4
 Autumn Fires—Stevenson. A4; F4; L3
 To Autumn—Keats. C8; N7
 Baltimore Oriole, The—Audubon. K8, N6
 Barefoot Boy, The—Whittier. C4; F6; N6
 Battle of the Ants, The—Thoreau. B7; H6; I7
 Bed in Summer—Stevenson. C3; G4
 Bee and the Flower, The—Tennyson. B4; F5;
 L4; N4
 Bell of Atri, The—Adapted from—Longfellow.
 B3; C5; F5; H3; L3
 Bells, The—Poe. A6; C6; F8; J8; K8; N7
 Beowulf. F5; N5
 Berrying Song—Larcom. A3; F3
 Be Strong—Babcock. B7; F7; J8
 Betty's Ride—Canby. B5; D5
 Billy the Dog that Made Good—Seton. A6; B6;
 D5
 Black Beauty—Sewell. F3; L5
 Blenheim, Battle of—Southey. B6; C5; F5; K6;
 N7
 Blind Men and the Elephant, The—Saxe. B5; C6;
 F4; K5; N5
 Block City—Stevenson. G4; L3
 Bluebird, The—Miller. F3; K4; N3
 Blue and the Gray, The—Finch. C4; F7; K6
 Bob White—Cooper. F5; K4
 Boone, Daniel (Stories of). B6; D7; H5
 Boy Wanted—Crane. J8; K7; L4
 Boy's Song, A—Hogg. B4; C4; F3; K3; M3;
 N3
 Bozzaris, Marco—Halleck. F8; K7
 The Brahmin, the Tiger, and the Jackal. A6;
 G3; I3; L5
 The Brahmin, the Tiger, and the Six Judges.
 A4; N4
 Breathes There the Man—Scott. K6; N7
 Brook, The—Tennyson. B5; C4; F5; K5; M5
 Brother Fox's Tar Baby. L3; M3
 Brown Thrush, The—Larcom. A3; C4; F3; I3;
 L5; M3
 Brownie, The (Stories of)—Mulock. C4; M3
 Bruce, Robert (Stories of). G7; I7
 Bruin's Boxing Match—Roberts. D4; E5
 Buffalo Chase, The—Parkman. B7; F7; H8
 Bugle Song, The—Tennyson. C5; F7; I8; K5
 Buried Treasure—Aesop. B4; L3
 Buttercup Gold—Richards. L4; N4
 Caesar, Julius (Stories of). F7; I8
 Calico Pie—Lear. L4; N3
 Casabianca—Hemans. C4; L5
 Cat, The Monkey, and the Chestnuts—Aesop. H3;
 L3
 Chambered Nautilus—Holmes. B7; C7; F7; I8;
 K8
 Charge of the Light Brigade, The—Tennyson.
 C5; I7; K6
 Chasing a Loon—Thoreau. B8; F8
 Child's Dream of a Star—Dickens. F7; K8; L5
 Child's Prayer, A—Edwards. M3; N3
 Christmas Carol, A—Dickens. B8; F6; I8
 Children's Hour, The—Longfellow. B5; C5; G5;
 I7; J8; L5
 Cinderella. C3; K3; L3; M3
 Circus Day Parade, The—Riley. B5; F4; J8;
 K5; L4; N4
 Cloud, The—Shelley. B7; C6; J8; K8; L5; N7
 Columbus, Christopher (Stories of). A6; B5,7;
 F7; H3,4; I7; K4,6; M5; N7
 Concord Hymn, Emerson. B8; C6; I7; K6; N6
 Confederate Soldier, The—Grady. C7; K8
 Contentment—Holmes. C7; I8
 Corn Song, The—Whittier. C7; K6; L4
 Cosette—Hugo. B4; C4
 Courtin', The—Lowell. B7; C7
 Courtship of Miles Standish—Longfellow. B7;
 C7; I7; N7
 Cratchits' Christmas Party, The—Dickens. C7;
 J8; K7
 Crossing the Bar—Tennyson. C8; K8; N5
 Crusoe, Robinson (Stories of)—Defoe. B5; C6;
 G7; I4,7; K3,4; M4; N6
 Daffodils—Wordsworth. B8; C4; F6; I8; J8;
 N7
 Davenport, Abraham—Whittier. B7; F7
 Dawn—Everett. B8; L7
 Daybreak—Longfellow. B5; F4; K8
 Day in June—Lowell. B7; C7; N7
 Day is Done—Longfellow. I8; L5

- Death of the Flowers—Bryant. C7; I7
 Defense of American Rights—Burke. C7; I8
 Deserted Village—Goldsmith. B8; N7
 Destruction of Sennacherib—Byron. B6; C6; N7
 Dissertation Upon Roast Pig—Lamb. B8; C8; J8; K8; N7
 Dog in the Manger. C3; L3
 Dog of Flanders. F3; M4
 Adventures of Don Quixote—Cervantes. A6; C8; F6; H6
 Don't Die on Third—Cameron. I7; K8
 Dotheboys Hall—Dickens. B7; J8
 Doubting Castle—Bunyon. C8; K7
 Duel, The—Field. B3; F3; G3; L4
 Deacon's Masterpiece, The—Holmes. B7; C6; K7
 Eagle, The—Tennyson. A5; B6; K4
 Echo, The. F4; L4
 Elegy—Gray. C8; K8
 Elf and the Doormouse, The—Herford. B3; M3
 Emperor's New Clothes, The—Andersen. B4; C3; G3
 England and America in 1782—Tennyson. C7; F6; I8
 Evangeline—Longfellow. B8; K8
 Fairies, The—Allingham. B3; C3; M3
 Fairies of the Caldon Low, The—Howitt. B4; C4
 Fairy Shipwreck—Sherman. A6; B5
 Farewell to the Farm—Stevenson. G5; N3
 Father Damien—Clifford. D6; G6; N5
 Fern Song—Tabb. A4; B6; K6; L4; N4
 Find a Way—Saxe. A6; J8
 First Potter, The—Burr. G6; J8
 First Snowfall, The—Lowell. F6; N5
 Fir Tree, The—Andersen. D5; K4
 Fish I Didn't Catch, The—Whittier. A5; B4; C4
 Flag Goes By, The—Bennet. B7; F7; N5
 Flag O' My Land—Daly. B6; K6
 Flag of Our Country. A5; B5
 Old Flag Forever, The. A4; N5
 Flower in a Crannied Wall—Tennyson. B7; K8
 Flower of Liberty, The—Holmes. B7; K7
 For A' That and A' That—Burns. B8; C7; F6,8; I8
 Foreign Children—Stevenson. F3; K3
 Foreign Lands—Stevenson. B3; F3
 Fountain, The—Lowell. B5; C4
 Fox and the Wolf, The. F3; L3
 Franklin, Benjamin (Stories of). A6; B7; C4; G6,8; J8; K8; N6
 Frogs at School. B3; L3
 Frog's Travels, The. B3; K3
 From a Railway Carriage—Stevenson. F3; L3
 Frost Spirit—Whittier. A5; N4
 Galahad, Sir (Stories of). C6; E3; F8; H7; K8; N5
 Gentleman, A—Newman. F8; K8
 Genuine Mexican Plug, A—Twain. G8; J8
 Get Out or Get in Line—Hubbard. I7; K7
 Gift of the Magi, The—O. Henry. B7; I8
 Gladness of Nature, The—Bryant. A5; K6; N5
 Grapevine Swing, The—Peck. G5; L4
 Grasshopper Green. B3; L3
 Great Stone Face, The—Hawthorne. B7; C8; F7; I7; J8; L6
 Great Winter, The—Blackmore. C8; H5
 Dr. Grenfell and the Deep Sea Mission—Duncan. D6; J8; N5
 Gulliver's Travels—Swift (Selections). B5; C4; D5; M4
 Handful of Clay, A—Van Dyke. B7; J8
 Hanging a Picture—Jerome. J8; K6
 Hansel and Gretel. B3; D3; K3
 Hare and the Tortoise, The. A3; C3; G4
 Hayloft, The—Stevenson. B3; G4; N3
 Height of the Ridiculous, The—Holmes. A6; B6; K5
 Heritage, The—Lowell. C7; I7; J7; K6
 Hercules, or The Three Golden Apples. C6; F4
 Herve Riel—Browning. F7
 Hiawatha—Longfellow (Selections from). A3; B4,5; C3,4,7; F4; I3; K3,5; L4; M4; N5
 Hie Away—Scott. B5; N4
 Home Sweet Home—Payne. C4; J8; L5
 Home Thoughts From Abroad—Browning. B8; F7
 Honest Indian, An. H4; L4
 Horatius—Macaulay. B6; C8; F6; N8
 House by the Side of the Road, The—Foss. G8; I7; K6
 House With Nobody in It, The—Kilmer. I7; J8
 How Sleep the Brave—Collins. A6; B8; C5
 How the Leaves Came Down—Coolidge. F3; L4; N3
 How the Robin Came—Whittier. A5; F5
 How They Brought the Good News from Ghent to Aix—Browning. B7; C5; F8; N6
 Humblebee, The—Emerson. C7; N7
 Humbug, The. H5; L5
 Hunting Song, The—Scott. K5; N5
 Hurricane—Audubon. B6; L6
 Husband Who Kept House, The. C3; D4
 I Am An American—Lieberman. B6; G8; H7; I7; J8; K5
 If—Kipling. B8; I8; J8
 If I Were a Sunbeam—Larcom. F3; L3
 I Hear America Singing—Whitman. A6; J8
 Incheape Rock, The—Southey. B5; F5; G6; K5

- Incident of the French Camp, An—Browning. F7; K5
- Indians, North American—Sprague. F8; L6
- In Flanders Fields—Galbreath and McCrae. C8; G8; I7; K5
- Ingratitude—Shakespeare. C5; K6
- In School Days—Whittier. H7; J8; K6
- I Remember, I Remember—Hood. C3; I7; J8
- It Can't Be Done—Guest. G8; H6
- Ivanhoe—Scott. C8; F6
- Jack and the Beanstalk. C3; L4
- Jaffar—Hunt. F7; I8
- Joan of Arc, The Story of. B6; C5; H8; I4; K8; M5
- Jumbies, The—Lear. B4; M3; N3
- Just a Job—Guest. I7; J8
- Jack O'Lantern, The. C4; E3; G4
- King Canute (Stories of). G7; K6
- King Philip to the White Settler—Everett. C7; K7
- King Robert of Sicily. F8; G7; K6
- King of the Golden River—Ruskin. B5; C5; F4; K4; M5
- King Solomon (Stories of). F4; L4,5
- Knights of the Silver Shield—Alden. B5; D5; I4
- Laetitia, The Little Patriot—Price. D4; H7
- Lafayette (Stories of). C7; K6,8
- Lamplighter, The—Stevenson. B3; F3; G3; L4; N3
- Land of Counterpane, The—Stevenson. F3; N3
- Land of Nod, The. F3; G3
- Landing of the Pilgrims—Hemans. B7; C5; I5; J7,8; K6
- Landing of the Pilgrims—Field. N4
- Landing of the Pilgrim Fathers—Everett. K8
- Land of Story Books, The—Stevenson. F3; G5; K3; L4; N3
- Land Where Hate Should Die, The—McCarthy. I8; J8
- Lark and the Farmer, The. I3; L4
- Last Lesson, The—Daudet. A6; C5; H6
- Lead Kindly Light—Newman. A6; K8
- Leak in the Dike, A—Cary. B3; C3; N5
- Lee, General Robert E. (Stories of). C5; L5
- Legend of the Arabian Astrologer—Irving. A6; B7
- Legend of Sleepy Hollow. B7; F7; I8
- Liberty and Union—Webster. C6; K8
- Lincoln, Abraham (Stories of). A7; B7; C7; F7; G5,8; H3,6,8; I7; K4,7; L4; N5,7
- Address at Gettysburg. A6; B8; C6; F7; I7; K6; L6; N7
- Lincoln's Second Inaugural Address. B7; I8; K8
- Lion's Share, The. C3; K3
- Little Brown Hands—Krout. C5; L5
- Little Daffy Down Dilly—Hawthorne. C4; K5; M4
- Little Giffen—Tichnor. F7; K7
- Little Match Girl, The—Andersen. C3; L5
- Lochinvar—Scott. B7; C8; F7
- Longfellow, Henry W. (Stories of). F4; L4; M4
- Lost Battalion—Forrest. I7; K8
- Lost Doll, The—Kingsley. B3; C3; N3
- Lullaby of an Infant Child—Scott. B6; N4
- Mad Tea Party, A—Carroll. A4; B4; C4; D4
- Makers of the Flag—Lane. B8; F7; G8; I7; K5; L6
- Man in the Moon, The—Riley. B7; F4
- Man Who Overcame, The—Hagedorn. B8; G8; I8
- Man Without A Country, The—Hale. B8; I8; L6
- March—Wordsworth. B5; F6
- Marjorie's Almanac—Aldrich. A3; B4; L4; N3
- Marmion and Douglas—Scott. I8; K8; N7
- May is Building Her House—Le Gallienne. E5; K7
- Maynard, John—Gough. I7; K6
- Message to Garcia, A—Hubbard. B7; F7; G8; I7; J8; K8; L6
- Miller of the Dee, The. B4; C4; J7; K4
- Moon, The. C3; F4
- Moore, Sir John, Burial of—Wolfe. C8; K7; M5
- Moni, The Goat Boy—Spyri. B4; N4
- Moses (Stories of). C6; F6,8; N3
- Moses at the Fair—Goldsmith. C5; N7
- Mountain and the Squirrel, The—Emerson. B4; C4; F3; L5; M3; N4
- Muller, Maud—Whittier. B7; C7
- My Bed is a Boat—Stevenson. G3; N3
- My Heart Leaps Up—Wordsworth. B8; I7; N7
- My Heart's in the Highlands—Burns. B5; N7
- My Shadow—Stevenson. C3; N3
- Name of Old Glory, The—Riley. B7; I5
- New England Weather—Twain. K5; N7
- New South, The—Grady. B7; F7; L8; N7
- New Teacher, The—Eggleston. C5; J8
- A Night Among the Pines—Stevenson. F8; K7
- Nightingale, Florence. D6; I8; N5
- Nightingale, The—Andersen. B5; M4
- Night With a Wolf, A—Taylor. B6; M4
- Nobility—Cary. I3; K5
- O Captain! My Captain!—Whitman. B8; C7; F7; K7
- October's Bright Blue Weather—Jackson. L4; M4
- Old Fashioned School, An—Hawthorne. C5; H7; L6

- Old Flag Forever, The—Stanton. A4; N5
 Old Ironsides—Holmes. B5; C4; I7; K6; N7
 Old Pipes and the Dryad—Stockton. E6; N4
 One, Two, Three—Bunner. C3; L4; N3
 Only One Mother—Cooper. H5; L4
 On the Grasshopper and Cricket—Keats. J8; K7
 Opportunity—Malone. H8; I7
 Opportunity—Ingalls. B8; K6
 Order for a Picture, An—Cary. A5; I6; K8
 Out of the Morning—Dickinson. L4; N3
 Owl and the Pussy Cat, The—Lear. B3; C3; F3; G3; K3; L4; N3
 Pandora—Hawthorne (Stories of). F4; L5; M5
 Pegasus, The Winged Horse. B4; D6; I6
 Persephone. B5; I3
 Pershing, General (Stories of). G6,8
 Pete of the Steel Mills—Hall. H8; J8
 Pickwick, Mr.—Dickens (Selections from). C8; F7; K7; N8
 Pied Piper of Hamelin, The—Browning. B5; C5; F4; K5; M5; N6
 Pine-Tree Shillings, The—Hawthorne. C5; H6; J8; K6; M5
 Pioneers—Whitman. E5; H8
 Pixy People, The—Riley. B6; N5
 Planting of the Apple Tree—Bryant. B6; K6; L5; N6
 Pocahontas (Stories of). A5; B4; C4; G7; K6; N7
 Polonius' Advice—Shakespeare. F7; I8; J8; K7
 Prairie Fire, A—Cooper. B7; H7
 Princess and the Goblin, The—McDonald. B6; K6
 Prodigal Son, The. B8; L8
 23d Psalm. A4; B7; C6; F6; I7; K7; L8; N4
 Psalm of Life, A—Longfellow. C6; K5
 Quails, The—Jatakas. B4; L4
 Quality of Mercy, The—Shakespeare. F7; I8
 Quest, The—Bumstead. A5; L5; M4
 Race For Silver Skates—Dodge. D6; N6
 Rain in Summer—Longfellow. A5; B6; C7; F6; K5
 Recessional—Kipling. B8; C6; F7; K8; N8
 Red Cross Knight and the Dragon, The—Spenser. C8; N6
 Relief of Leiden, The. K8; N8
 Revenge—Tennyson. F7; K5
 Revere, Paul—Longfellow. B7; C5; F6; I7; K4; L5; N6
 Ring Out Wild Bells—Tennyson. B8; C8; K5; L5; N8
 Rip Van Winkle—Irving. B8; C7; F4; I7; K8; L7; M5; N8
 Rising in 1776, The—Read. A6; K7
 Robert of Lincoln—Bryant. B4; C4; F5; J8; K4; N4
 Robin Hood (Stories of). B5; C5; F5,6; I5; N7
 Robin Redbreast—Allingham. B3; F3; K3; N3
 Rock-A-By-Lady, The—Field. B4, N3
 Roosevelt, Theodore (Stories of). A6; D5,8; G5, 6,7,8; J8; K8
 Rose, The—Rosetti. B4; C3
 St. Valentine. E4
 Sand Piper, The—Thaxter. B6; C4; F4; I8; K4; M4; N4
 Sea Fever—Masefield. E4; J8
 Selfish Giant, The—Wilde. G7; K5
 September—Jackson. B3; F3; L4; N4
 Seven Times One Are Seven—Ingelow. C4; L4; N3
 Shadow, The—Sherman. A3; L4
 Shepherd Boy and the Wolf, The. C3; L5
 Ship of State—Longfellow. B7; C6; H7; K4; N7
 Singing—Stevenson. C3; L3; N3
 Sinking of the Titanic, The—Bride. I7; K8
 Sir Patrick Spens. B8; C8
 Skeleton in Armor, The—Longfellow. C7; G6
 Sleeping Beauty, The—Grimm. C3; L5
 Sleeping Outdoors—Allen. D7; I8; K8
 Smallest Soldier of All, The. G5; H4
 Snowbound—Whittier. B8; C7; F7; J8; K8; N8
 Snow Image, The—Hawthorne. F3; L5; M4
 Snow-Storm, The—Emerson. C7; K7
 Snow White and Rose Red—Grimm. C3; N3
 Soldier's Reprieve, The—Robbins. A5; C4; H5; K5; L7
 Solitary Reaper, The—Wordsworth. C8; J8; K7; N7
 Somebody's Mother. A4; I4; L5
 Song—Riley. B6; N5
 Song of the Chattahoochee—Lanier. A6; B7; C7; N6
 Song of Marion's Men—Bryant. C5; K4
 Song of the Sea, A—Cunningham. B5; C4
 Song of Triumph, A—Morgan. J8; K5
 Spacious Firmament, The—Addison. C8; H7
 Spartacus to the Gladiators—Kellogg. C7; F8; L7
 Spider and the Fly, The—Howitt. F3; K6; L5
 Spider's Telegraph Wire, The—Fabre. D8; J8; K6
 Spring—Thaxter. A3; N3
 Spring—Timrod. K6; N7
 Star-Spangled Banner, The—Key. B5; K5; N4
 Story of a Salmon, The—Jordan. B7; H5; K8; N6
 Steadfast Tin Soldier, The—Andersen. K8; N3
 Sugar-Plum Tree, The—Field. B4; N4
 Sunken Treasure, The—Hawthorne. B5; K6; M5
 Sweet and Low—Tennyson. C3; F3; N4
 Talking in Their Sleep—Thomas. A4; L4

- Taming of Animals—Mitchell. A6; J8
 Tax-Gatherer, The—Tabb. F4; L4
 Tell, William (Stories of). A5; B6; C5; I7; M5; N7
 Thanksgiving (Stories of). A6; B3; C3; D3; E3,4,5; F3; H3,6; J8; K4,6,7; L3,4; M3; N3,4
 Thinker, The—Braley. A6; G8; I7; J8
 Three Strangers, The—Hardy. B8; F8
 Thor (Stories of). B6,8; C6; D6; F4; K6; N3
 Throstle, The—Tennyson. B8; F3; J8; N5
 'Tis the Last Rose of Summer—Moore. K6; L5
 Today—Carlyle. B8; J8
 To Autumn. C8; N7
 To a Butterfly—Wordsworth. F5; L4
 To a Fringed Gentian—Bryant. C7; I7; N7
 To a Mountain Daisy—Burns. B7; F6; I8
 To a Skylark—Shelley. C8; N7
 To a Waterfowl—Bryant. B8; C6; F7; K7
 Tom, the Water Baby—Kingsley. B4; F3
 Tragic Story, A—Thackeray. B8; K4
 Travel—Stevenson. C4; G6
 Tree, The—Bjornson. F4; K3; L5; N3
 Trees—Kilmer. J8; K6
 Trees—Carman. A6; B7
 Tubal Cain—Mackay. B7; I8; J8; K5
 Ugly Duckling, The—Andersen. C3; F3; G3; L4; N3
 Union and Liberty—Holmes. A6; C6
 Verdun Belle. A5; G6
 Village Blacksmith, The—Longfellow. C4; F6; I8; J8; K4; L5; M4; N4
 Village Schoolmaster, The—Goldsmith. C5; H7
 Vision of Sir Launfal—Lowell. B8; F7
 Visit from St. Nicholas, A—Moore. B3; C3; F3; K4; L5; M4; N4
 Visit from the Sea, A—Stevenson. F4; M4
 Vitaii Lampada—Newbolt. B8; F7
 Walrus and the Carpenter, The—Carroll. F5; K5
 Wanted—Holland. F7; I7
 Washington, George (Stories of). A5; B6,8; C3, 6; D3,6; G5; K6,7; L4,6; N5
 Webster, Daniel (Stories of). G8; H8; I7; L5
 We Thank Thee. A4; L4
 What Constitutes a State—Jones. B8; C7; K7
 What Do We Plant—Abbey. I7; J8
 Where Go the Boats—Stevenson. K3; M3
 Which Loved Best?—Allison. L5; N3
 Which Shall It Be?—Biers. I8; J8
 Whistle, The—Franklin. I7; J8; L6
 Whittington and the Cat. B3; C3; K4
 Wild Swans, The—Andersen. D4; I3
 Wind, The—Stevenson. B3; C3; F3; G4; K3; M3
 Wind and the Moon, The—MacDonald. B5; K5; N5
 Wind in a Frolic, The—Howitt. A4; C4
 Windy Nights—Stevenson. C3; F4; G3
 Winkelried, Arnold. C5; F6
 Winter—Tennyson. B6; F3; M3; N3
 Wish, A—Rogers. C7; K6
 Wishing—Allingham. B4; F4; M3; N3
 Wishing-Gate, The—Chollet. I3; K4
 Wolfe's Last Battle—Parkman. I7; K8
 Woodman, Spare That Tree—Morris. C4; H7; I7
 Work—Van Dyke. B7; J8; K5
 Wreck, The—Dickens. D7; F8
 Wreck of the Hesperus, The—Longfellow. C5; F4; K6
 Wynken, Blynken, and Nod—Field. B3; C3; F3; I3; L3; N3
 Wee Willie Winkie—Kipling. K8
 What is An American—Crevecoeur. C7; K7
 What the Earliest Men Did for Us—Burnham. G6; I8
 Winter Night—Butts. M3; N3
 Yellow Violet—Bryant. A5; N7
 Your Flag and My Flag—Nesbit. B4; I3
 Youssouf—Lowell. B7; F7

SOME HIGH SPOTS IN THE READING PROGRAM

E. EHRLICH SMITH

*Randolph-Macon College
Ashland, Virginia*

HAS THERE really been developed generally a new attitude towards reading? During the last few years an enormous amount of material has appeared in regard to this one subject—undoubtedly the most important subject of the curriculum. The searchlight of the science of education has been directed upon many phases of the reading program by able men and women. It is the purpose of this article to try to point out some of the significant findings, and, at the same time, to call attention to some processes that are being investigated which give promise in the future.

First, let us consider the old and new attitudes towards our literary heritage. "An older view of our literary heritage regarded it as a treasure chest of fine selections, handed down from the past, to be drilled into the memories of children. A newer view looks upon our literary heritage as a love of beauty in literature combined with the habit of enjoying a growing wealth of writings so good that they can be fully appreciated only as they are read or memorized. The older view emphasized words; the new view aims to develop a feeling for the ideas back of the words. In the older view memory was a granary. In the newer view it is a tool. The older view placed chief emphasis on the sheer act of recall. The newer view puts chief emphasis on a widening of sympathy and understanding, with recall as an important by-product. The older view turned the child's thought toward the past. The newer view builds on the past but makes the discriminating quest of new beauty great adventure."¹

Even a cursory reading of this paragraph reveals the fact that we are now immensely concerned with attitudes and habits—a view that rightfully has a large place in deliberations upon, and investigations about any school subject. We have the privilege of directing into proper channels the energy and intelligence of those we instruct; the opportunity is ours, and "we must take the current as it flows, else lose our ventures"—to love the beautiful in literature, to develop the habit of enjoying writings so good that they can be fully appreciated only as they are memorized—is not this the current? (6; 9)²

A serious weakness of reading instruction formerly lay in the fact that the selections used were organized primarily for teaching pupils to read. We can correct this error by setting up a new standard, which is this: Choose selections for their value in revealing the great fields of exploration, travel, biography, invention, history, industry, and science. In other words, bring young people into contact with enough and good books, with the assurance that, intelligence permitting, life-long habits of intelligent reading become fixed thereby. (10; 13-B)

But this is a truth that may be neglected unless we take care to make the proper selections! The first desideratum is this: there must be no trite stuff in the reading program; both literary and work-type material must be selected with care and must be suited in every respect for the age and understanding of those we teach. This is the stuff that is to broaden their sympathies and understanding. This is the beginning

¹ The Journal of the National Education Association, March, 1926.

² References are to the corresponding numbers in the bibliography at the end of the article.

of a promising field of investigation: Just what are the interests of children in the several grades and just exactly what material fills these needs? (13-B; 13-C).

Our literary heritage is constantly being increased, and our reading instruction, by the new standards, must embrace the best of the new books. Thus it is that we are kept, by these standards, on the alert. We are not content to be behind the times. The older view turned the child's attention to the past; the newer view builds on this past, but makes the discriminating quest of new beauty a great adventure.

As previously stated—"The older view placed chief emphasis on the sheer act of recall. The newer view puts chief emphasis on a widening of sympathy and understanding, with recall as an important by-product." We have long professed to be concerned with the relation of literature to ideals and attitudes, appreciations, and conduct in general, but in reality have we not been content with the memorizing of facts discovered in literature or about it? or with an analytic study of the mechanics of words, rhythms, figures of speech, and like elements of structure? (2)

In this connection, Henry Van Dyke asks a question and answers it: "Are not these two aims, instruction and pleasure, so different as to be necessarily separate? Purely didactic poems and novels that are written to prove things are almost always a weariness to the flesh. Is it not equally true that works of pure literature may be misused, spoiled, crippled, or even killed in the class-room? Is there not a natural hostility, or perhaps even a family quarrel, between the Muses and Minerva,—a lady who was always inclined to be jealous of her half-brother Apollo?" (14)

The widening of understanding in particular—what about this? It is extremely important that we develop effective reading habits in content subjects. It has been clearly demonstrated that a pupil who reads narrative material quite well may

read very poorly when the passages tell the conditions of an arithmetic problem or give directions to be followed in the study of grammar. Just as spelling and language habits must be emphasized in every subject, so essential reading habits must be cultivated in the study of literature, arithmetic, history, geography, and other content subjects.

Each subject, in addition to the general habits employed in reading, requires specific skills peculiar to its purposes and subject matter. A new standard is involved in the answer to this question: what relationship exists between our objectives and the various activities of the school that comprise reading? Chapter V of the Twenty-Fourth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education helps us to arrive at an answer. Here the question is attacked by giving concrete suggestions for the initial period (grade I), the period of growth in reading (grades II and III), the period of enriched experience (grades IV, V, VI), and the period of independent application of reading ability (grades VII, VIII, IX).

The older view emphasized words; the new view aims to develop a feeling for the ideas back of the words. Now our program of reading instruction reaches out for the development of a rich vocabulary and the association of spoken words with their written symbols. Again, we are on the road to a new standard: What are the best methods of word analysis? What is the place of phonetic analysis in word recognition? What shall we do about dictionary study? We have always been anxious to get our readers to develop instantaneous recognition of words and to fit them into the meaning of the text—effective habits of independent attack in dealing with unknown words. This is a problem in the mechanics of reading. (7; 13-A).

Let us assume that it is comparatively easy to demonstrate the wide range of reading abilities and interests represented by

the members of a single class or grade or age group. Is it as simple to demonstrate the inadequacy of traditional procedures or to initiate effective provisions for individual differences? Let us also assume that as yet there is no general realization of the utter inadequacy and waste in traditional reading recitations. Do we not need to have well defined the range of reading abilities and the means for providing for every pupil? Such a standard demands that we know definitely what diagnostic teaching has revealed in order that we ourselves may set about remedial work effectively; in order that individual difficulties may be straightened out; in order that every pupil may get the full share of attention that modern science provides. (3; 13-E).

These standards have to be apprehended before we can expect to make much headway in achieving the great objectives we have in mind in the reading program.

REFERENCES

1. Buswell, Guy T.: *Fundamental Reading Habits: A Study of their Development*, Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 21. Department of Education, University of Chicago, 1922.
2. Gray, Clarence T.: *Deficiencies in Reading Ability*. D. C. Heath and Company, 1922. This book presents an analysis of the reading process. Tests and experiments for determining reading ability are given. Remedial measures are outlined.
3. Gray, William S.: *Remedial Cases in Reading: Their Diagnosis and Treatment*. University of Chicago Press, 1922. The unusual difficulties in reading are treated here, many individual cases being diagnosed and appropriate methods of remedial instruction being given in each case.
4. Kerfoot, J. B.: *How to Read*. Houghton Mifflin Company. This book presents the thesis that reading and listening are active, constructive, evaluating processes.
5. O'Brien, John A.: *Silent Reading*. Macmillan Company, 1921. Here are found contributions to the field of silent reading.
6. Parker, Samuel C.: *Types of Elementary Teaching and Learning*. Ginn and Company, 1923. This book presents examples of classroom practice, described in detail: Chapter V, Beginning Reading; Chapter VI, Scientific Investigation of Reading; Chapter XI, Skillful Silent Reading.
7. Pennell, M. E., and Cusack, A. M.: *How to Teach Reading*. Houghton Mifflin Company, 1923. This book treats of both oral and silent reading habits in the first three grades.
8. *The Second Yearbook*, Department of Elementary School Principals, 1201 Sixteenth St., N. W., Washington, D. C. The Problem of the Elementary School Principal in the Light of the Testing Movement. Chapter VI is devoted to remedial work.
9. Simpson, I. Jewell: *Silent Reading; Suggestions for Testing and for Corrective Work*. Maryland School Bulletin, March, 1926. State Department of Education, Baltimore, Maryland. This bulletin treats of the development of reading abilities, testing, training in the different phases of reading. Well organized, and contains practical suggestions of value.
10. Smith, C. Alphonso: *What Literature Can Do for Me*. Doubleday, Page and Company. This points out the cultural value of reading, and contains illustrations for the student of literature.
11. Smith, Nila B.: *One Hundred Ways of Teaching Silent Reading*. World Book Company. Here are found exercises designed to give practice in developing speed, comprehension, selection, organization, retention, and skimming.
12. Stone, Clarence R.: *Silent and Oral Reading*. Houghton Mifflin Company. This book presents methods for the development of silent and oral reading.
13. *Twenty-Fourth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education*, Part I: Report of the National Committee on Reading. Public School Publishing Company. (A) Chapter IV: The development of a Meaningful Vocabulary and of Independence in Reading; (B) Chapter V: The Relation of Reading to Content Subjects and Other School Activities; (C) Chapter VI: The Relation Between Reading and Literature; (D) Chapter VII: Appropriate Materials for Instruction in Reading; (E) Chapter VIII: Provision for Individual Differences; (F) Chapter X: Diagnosis and Remedial Work; (G) Chapter XI: Ways and Means of Putting an Improved Reading Program into Operation.
14. Van Dyke, Henry: *Literature in Education: A Teacher's Simple "Articles of Faith" Concerning the Making of a Few More Good Readers*.

ORALIZATION

MARY O. STARK*

A DEEP interest in reform has been apparent within the past few years, which has brought about some radical changes in methods of presentation of English in the grades, and the setting of new minimum essentials. Our world of "what we must do" is all in a-whirl but, fortunately for the stability of our purpose, we recall, as an old, familiar friend, Dewey's famous dictum of long ago: "As is the teacher, so is the school." This we will take, then, as our rock, our foundation of security from whence we reach out into the sea of new ideas and gather unto ourselves those that will enable us to make our school worthy. With scientific attitude we relinquish some of our pet hobbies and accept the facts that we must teach fewer things; skillfully isolate those few; concentrate our "thunder," and, assisted by the most we can make of our personalities and all the arts the masters in the new school of thought can give us, direct it and thunder away for all we are worth toward the attainment of the new ideals.

The new procedure is the socialization of school work, particularly English work. This is as it should be, since we believe that social efficiency should be the aim of achievement for all men, and that socialized oral composition is the broad highway that leads to the summit. Like all great truths, it is so simple that the marvel is that socialization was not always practised. How, then, shall we secure it? Since we truly begin to learn only when we begin to use, it is fundamental that we let use of organized, motivated oral speech be the basis of our procedure.

* This paper was prepared for a course on the teaching and supervision of English in the elementary grades. The course was given during the summer of 1925, by Dr. S. A. Leonard, at the University of Wisconsin.

The teacher must realize first of all that grammar grade children are just reaching the age when the opinions of even revered grown-ups are valued far less than are those of their "crowd." Her first plunge must land her in the background of self-effacement: she must seat herself as one of the audience she is providing for the pupil, for the pupil is to occupy the center of the stage in the oral composition period, the teacher having subtly arranged the details. If she is skillful, she may delude the pupils into thinking the plan wholly theirs, but she must remember that she who is to guide, train, direct, and inspire must be only a humble part of the child's audience.

The thing that matters to the pupil is that he is being judged by his peers. He loves to tell of his experiences: he loves to "play to the gallery:" he loves best of all the approbation of his group. This is his opportunity and he will be natural and do his best if he has something to talk about in which he is vitally interested, if he is sure of a sympathetic audience and that he will not be nagged and stopped for criticism every time he makes an error. All he needs is a good incentive and fair encouragement.

Is a child to stand and monopolize valuable time in rambling on and on? Certainly not. Real problems and real needs must be evolved out of his environment for his use. He must be made to realize that the need is pressing: his motive for solving his problem must exceed, if possible, even his interest in it. Seeing the needs, finding the problems, opening the way,—these are some of the jobs of the teacher. Children are more conscious of their own faults, and more appreciative of

good points in their competitors than they often receive credit for. We must not forget that emulation is one of the strongest instincts: if only they can once feel the glow that accompanies the mastery of a task, proved to them by the unstinted praise of their audience, a very real victory will have been won and the way paved for further achievement. All pleasurable work must come from within, and this is why pupils must be joyously conscious of having done well.

Having something of interest within his very own experience to tell, how shall the child be taught to tell it? He must use short, clear sentences, not disconnected and choppy, but to the point. Teach him the sentence. Teach him to listen to himself and revise, correct, improve his sentence if he can. Let him ask his classmates to assist him, if they can, to acquire better expression. Let the teacher be the "court of last appeal" unless she be one of those rare "real teachers" who can be "one of the boys" on occasion, and can, therefore, be admitted gladly into the inner circle of friendly advisers. Happy teacher, she!

The pupil must be taught that his sentences must be related; that he must stick to the point; that he cannot tell it all at one time. This requires concentration and much practice, but he soon comes to admire his own more orderly way of speaking and becomes a merciless self-critic. Encourage the use of new and unusual words. Praise the child generously every time he consciously and deliberately improves his speech by such use. Children are such little creatures of imitation and emulation that you may well be surprised at the enrichment of the class vocabulary when once the incentive has been provided. Provide it. Here is the best chance, too, to guide in the selection of the best, or the choicest word to fit an occasion. A real part of the teacher's task must be to lead the child to see that words have shades

of meaning, and that practice alone will enable him to use them intelligently.

While abundant opportunity must be given for free expression, that, after all, is not real composition. Time and opportunity must be given for oral expression in a more orderly, formal, pretentious way. The child must then be allowed plenty of time for the collection of materials that will give him definite factual information on the subject on which he wishes to talk. A good class room library or at least a few well chosen books on the teacher's desk should be at his command. He may, and doubtless will, need help in organizing his thought, but the vital thing is that he have something worthwhile to tell, and that he tell it freely. Self-consciousness and deliberateness will come as he grows older.

Of course he will make errors. We can't hope to correct them all, nor wish to, but the teacher can drill on a few errors, and make the child conscious of them and desirous of correcting them. This last is, of course, the important thing. "Correct speech must be caught, not taught." Drill, drill, eternal drill; formally, informally: sometimes drudgery, sometimes fun; but drill is the procedure, in some form, that we must use to insure accuracy. Drills, when given occasionally as games, may enliven a dull or break a tense situation, just as song may be used for the same purpose. Suggestions for such games are given in all modern elementary English texts, and there are, in addition, whole books devoted to language games. Used in moderation, these are good. So long as the child has to divide his attention between what he has to say and how he must say it he can never do his very best; so, again, drill is all important in effecting automatic mastery of correct form. He must come to feel that while he can doubtless be understood no matter how he says what he has to say, the world has standards by which he

(Continued on Page 54)

SUPPLEMENT TO THE WINNETKA GRADED BOOK LIST

CARLETON WASHBURN AND MABEL VOGEL

Winnetka, Illinois

INTRODUCTION

THIS SUPPLEMENT is a list of the books which were excluded from the Winnetka Graded Book List because of low literary value or because they contained subject matter unsuitable for children. Thirteen children's librarians rated the books (those read by enough children to justify grading them) and eliminated all unsuitable books.

The books were rated on a four point scale as follows:

- (1) of unquestionable literary merit
- (2) valuable for the list, although not of high literary quality
- (3) not recommended—because of low literary value
- (4) not recommended—because of subject content

All books which were rated by three-fourths or more of the judging librarians as being unsuitable for children either because of literary merit or subject matter are graded in this list. All data, such as are given for books on the graded list itself are given for each book.

EXPLANATION

The books are listed according to the median reading grades of children who read and enjoyed them. Below is given an example, with an explanation of the data.

Statistical Data

1. BROWNIES AND THE GOBLINS.

	No.	% liking	Value	Age
B.	24	96	79	9.4
G.	16	88	82	9.3

	Rdg. grd.	3-4-5	50%	Cities	Index
B.	4.8	91%	4-5	9	36
G.	4.3	93%	4-5		

Descriptive Data

1. BROWNIES AND THE GOBLINS. N. M. Banta and A. B. Benson. Flanagan. 68c.

The part I like best is where the moon played ball with the brownies and the goblins.

Explanation of Statistical Data

B. 24, G. 16. Twenty-four boys and 16 girls reported on the book.

% liking—B. 96, G. 88. Ninety-six per cent of the boys who read the book liked it and 88% of the girls liked it.

Value—B. 79, G. 82. The average interest value given to the book by boys was 79 and that given by the girls was 82. Children's reports on interest values have been given numerical equivalents to make averaging possible.

Age—B. 9.4, G. 9.3. The median age of the boys who read and enjoyed the book was 9.4 and that for the girls who read and enjoyed it was 9.3.

Rdg. grd.—B. 4.8, G. 4.3. The average (median) reading ability of the boys who read and enjoyed the book was between the standard for fourth grade and that for fifth grade, as shown by the Stanford Silent Reading Test. It corresponds to a point .8 of a grade above fourth. The median reading grade of the girls who liked it was .3 of a grade beyond fourth grade standard.

3-4-5—B. 91%, G. 93%. Ninety-one per cent of the boys who read and enjoyed it had either third, fourth, or fifth grade reading ability. Ninety-three per cent of the girls who enjoyed it had either third, fourth, or fifth grade reading ability.

50%—B. 4-5, G. 4-5. The middle 50% of the boys and girls who read and enjoyed it had fourth or fifth grade reading ability.

Cities—9. The book was read in 9 cities.

Index—36. The index of popularity is 36. The books are arranged within grades

according to this index of popularity. It is the product of the number of children who liked the book and the number of cities in which it was read. It shows better than any other factor how widely the book was read and liked.

Explanation of Descriptive Data

Finally, pages 49-52, author, title, and publisher are given. There is also a typical comment made by a child. This comment was chosen as the most typical one made on each book.

SUPPLEMENT TO THE WINNETKA GRADED BOOK LIST*

Books rated by three-fourths or more of the expert children's librarians as not recommended because of low literary value or containing subject matter unsuitable for children.

PART I—STATISTICAL DATA

FOURTH GRADE

Title	No.		% liking		Value		Age		Rdg.Gr.		3-4-5		50%		Cities	Index
	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G		
1. BROWNIES AND THE GOBLINS.....	24	16	96	88	79	82	9.4	9.3	4.8	4.3	91	93	4-5	4-5	9	36
2. STORIES FROM A MOUSE HOLE.....	21	32	90	94	72	76	9.0	9.0	4.4	4.7	100	83	4	4	5	25
3. LAND OF OZ.....	10	17	100	94	83	64	9.8	10.8	4.0	6.7	80	62 ²	3-4	6-7	7	21

FIFTH GRADE

Title	No.		% liking		Value		Age		Rdg.Gr.		4-5-6		50%		Cities	Index
	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G		
4. BUNNY BROWN AND HIS SISTER SUE.....	10	73	100	97	89	86	10.0	10.6	4.9	5.8	77	70 ³	4-5	5-6	22	176
5. ADVENTURES OF REDDY FOX.....	53	42	96	95	78	74	9.9	9.6	4.9	5.1	84	73 ³	4-5	4-5	17	153
6. RAGGEDY ANN.....	6	59	100	95	84	84		9.2		5.3	73			5	18	108
7. BILLY WHISKERS.....	43	27	100	93	90	82	9.9	9.9	5.5	5.4	72	56	5-6	5-6	15	105
8. MARIGOLD'S PONY...	13	51	100	94	78	79	9.8	10.2	5.3	5.5	92	73	5	5-6	12	72
9. AMERICA'S STORY FOR AMERICA'S CHILDREN	44	24	89	88	75	68	10.3	10.5	5.5	6.3	62 ²	57	5-6	5-6	9	56
10. GRANDPA'S LITTLE GIRLS.....	10	55	90	98		81		11.5		5.9		69		5-6	6	36
11. HONEY BUNCH, HER FIRST VISIT TO THE CITY.....		26		100		86		10.1		5.8		65		5-6	12	36
12. LITTLE PRUDY.....	2	30	50	93		77		10.4		5.4		64		4-5-6	12	36
13. CURLY TOPS ON STAR ISLAND.....	19	24	95	100	79	81	10.9	11.3	6.0	5.8	72	75 ²	5-6	5-6	8	32
14. HONEY BUNCH, JUST A LITTLE GIRL.....		30		97		87		10.3		5.9		72		5-6	8	24
15. LIGHTFOOT, THE DEER.....	17	26	100	96	82	88	9.7	10.3	5.1	5.5	77	68	4-5	4-5-6	6	24
16. RUTH OF BOSTON...	13	21	69	76		70		10.5		5.3		88		5	6	18
17. BARTY CRUSOE....	15	21	100	95	82	82	10.2	10.1	5.4	5.5	73	80	5	4-5-6	4	16
18. MOTHER WEST WIND'S WHERE STORIES.....	12	18	92	78	73	67	10.1	10.2	5.4	5.3	91	93	5	5	4	12
19. AMERICAN HISTORY STORIES.....	25	7	80	86	75		9.6		5.3		80		4-5		2	6

* Issued by Winnetka Individual Materials, Inc., Skokie School, Winnetka, Illinois, 1926. Used by special permission.
¹ Descriptive data for these books are given on pages 49ff. ² Also grades 5-6-7. ³ Also grades 3-4-5.

SIXTH GRADE

Title	No.		% liking		Value		Age		Rdg.Grd.		5-6-7		50%		Cities	Index
	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G		
20. BOBBSEY TWINS...	13	141	92	96	89	88	11.2	10.6	6.5	7.4	50	50*	5-6-7	5-6-7	23	345
21. LITTLE MAID OF PROVINCETOWN.....	3	108	67	97		82		11.9		6.9		56		6-7	16	176
22. BOBBSEY TWINS AT SCHOOL.....	16	75	100	96	83	87	9.8	10.3	6.0	6.4	47	61	5-6-7	5-6-7	18	162
23. BOBBSEY TWINS ON BLUEBERRY ISLAND..	15	60	100	100	90	90	10.8	10.7	6.0	6.9	67	60	5-6-7	6-7	19	152
24. BOBBSEY TWINS AT SNOW LODGE.....	10	63	100	100	89	85	9.9	10.2	6.7	6.7	60	62	6-7	6-7	19	133
25. BOBBSEY TWINS ON A HOUSE BOAT.....	19	49	95	96	90	86	10.9	10.6	6.4	6.9	72	66	6	6-7	19	133
26. LITTLE MAID OF MASSACHUSETTS COLONY.....	4	99	75	97		81		11.7		6.9		63		6-7	12	120
27. BOBBSEY TWINS AT THE SEASHORE.....	9	60	100	97		87		10.9		6.7		64		6-7	15	105
28. BOBBSEY TWINS AT MEADOW BROOK.....	9	53	100	100		80		10.6		6.9		62		6-7	16	96
29. BOBBSEY TWINS IN THE GREAT WEST...	9	51	100	100		89		10.9		6.9		65		6-7	16	96
30. BOBBSEY TWINS AT HOME.....	11	56	100	98	89	90	10.5	11.0	6.8	6.5	55	58	6-7-8	5-6	13	91
31. BOBBSEY TWINS AND BABY MAY.....	8	50	100	96		91		10.3		6.6		65		6-7	15	90
32. BOBBSEY TWINS AT CEDAR CAMP.....	7	48	100	98		85		10.5		6.9		64		6-7	18	90
33. BOBBSEY TWINS IN THE COUNTRY.....	9	42	100	98		83		10.5		6.5		61		5-6-7	17	85
34. BOBBSEY TWINS IN WASHINGTON.....	11	46	100	98	89	86	10.7	10.4	7.5	6.8	55	67	6-7-8	6-7	14	84
35. BOBBSEY TWINS AT THE COUNTY FAIR...	9	45	100	98		87		10.4		6.7		59		5-6-7	16	80
36. BOBBSEY TWINS CAMPING OUT.....	10	46	100	100	89	83	11.0	10.3	7.3	6.7	70	61*	6-7	6-7	13	78
37. BOBBSEY TWINS ON THE DEEP BLUE SEA.	10	36	100	100	86	94	10.0	10.5	7.0	6.9	50	58*	6-7-8	6-7	14	70
38. MISS MINERVA AND WILLIAM GREEN HILL	12	37	100	97	89	91	11.0	11.3	6.5	6.8	75	72	6-7	6-7	14	70
39. LITTLE MAID OF NARAGANSETT BAY..	0	61		100		86		11.5		6.8		72		6-7	11	66
40. LITTLE MAID OF OLD CONNECTICUT...	3	44	100	100		90		11.0		6.7		64		5-6-7	7	35
41. EDITHA'S BURGLAR.	3	28	67	93		77		11.0		6.2		52		5-6-7	7	21
42. GRANDPA'S LITTLE GIRLS AT SCHOOL...	2	33	100	91		83		11.2		6.8		60		6-7	7	21
43. LAND OF OZ.....	10	17	100	94	83	64	9.8	10.8	4.0	6.7	80	62*	3-4	6-7	7	21
44. LITTLE MAID OF OLD NEW YORK.....	0	28		100		80		11.6		6.5		71		6-7	7	21
45. ADVENTURES OF ELIZABETH ANN.....	16	29	94	100	72	68	10.9	10.5	5.8	6.1	87	80*	5-6	5-6	5	20
46. MABEL'S MISHAP..	10	19	90	100	63	81	11.6	11.4	6.1	6.5	78	74	5-6	5-6-7	2	6

*Also grades 3-4-5.

*Also grade 6-7-8.

To be Concluded in the March Review.

PART II—DESCRIPTIVE DATA

FOURTH GRADE

1. BROWNIES AND THE GOBLINS. N. M. Banta and A. B. Benson. Flanagan. 68c.

The part I liked best is where the moon played ball with the brownies and the goblins.

2. STORIES FROM A MOUSE HOLE. Ruth O. Dyer. Little. 75c.

I like the part where Sniffy fell into the jar of jam.

3. LAND OF OZ. L. Frank Baum. Reilly.

The interesting part was where the army of General Jinfur and her women captured the city of Emerald.

FIFTH GRADE

4. BUNNY BROWN AND HIS SISTER SUE. Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

Every day something happened to Bunny and his sister Sue. One day they wandered into a moving picture show. The people saw them and a lady who knew them took them home.

5. ADVENTURES OF REDDY FOX. Thornton W. Burgess. Little. 60c.

Granny teaches Reddy Fox how to walk over a bridge and how to get Farmer Brown's chickens, and teaches Reddy some tricks.

6. RAGGEDY ANN. Johnny Gruelle. Voland.

The part I like best was where Raggedy Ann went through the wringer and came out as flat as a pancake.

7. BILLY WHISKERS. Frances L. Montgomery. Saalfeld.

I like the part where he is in the circus. The wind comes up, the tents go down, and Billy gets loose and finds Nanny.

8. MARIGOLD'S PONY. Howard B. Famous. Western. 10c.

It told some interesting things about Baby Pony and Molly. I like the part where Molly fell down in front of the little White Lady's house. Then the Little White Lady came running out of the house.

9. AMERICA'S STORY FOR AMERICA'S CHILDREN. Mara L. Pratt. Heath.

It tells how hard we fought for freedom. It shows that we were right when George III tried to tax us and also that we were true to our country.

10. GRANDPA'S LITTLE GIRLS. Alice T. Curtis. Penn. \$1.50.

It is about two girls who live with their grandfather. They have to go to school, but don't like it so they run away and get lost. They are in the woods for nearly one week.

11. HONEY BUNCH, HER FIRST VISIT TO THE CITY. Helen L. Thorndyke. Grosset. 60c.

It tells what they did in New York. She put the cake in the trunk. It tells about the bad boy.

12. LITTLE PRUDY. Sophie May. Lothrop. 75c.

I laughed when little Prudy got the toad in her mouth.

13. CURLY TOPS ON STAR ISLAND. Howard R. Garis. Cupples.

I like it because it has you excited all of the time and then you laugh. The Curly Tops saw a fox and they thought it was a bear. They then saw a tramp.

14. HONEY BUNCH—JUST A LITTLE GIRL. Helen L. Thorndyke. Grosset. 60c.

Honey Bunch's mother helped her make a pie and when she heard her father coming she set it on the chair. When her father came in he sat down on it.

15. LIGHTFOOT, THE DEER. Thornton W. Burgess. Little. \$1.50.

Lightfoot discovered Miss Dainty-foot and she afterward became Mrs. Lightfoot.

16. RUTH OF BOSTON. James Otis. American Book. 52c.

It told about Ruth going abroad on the ships. She went on a long voyage to England.

17. BARTY CRUSOE AND HIS MAN SATURDAY. Frances H. Burnett. Donahue.

The part I liked best was where the pirates found Barty.

18. MOTHER WEST WIND'S WHERE STORIES. Thornton W. Burgess. Little. \$1.

I liked this because it told how Miss 'Gator made the sun do her work to hatch the eggs. I liked best the part where Peter Rabbit kept asking questions. The story of how the bison got his hump was good.

19. AMERICAN HISTORY STORIES. Mara L. Pratt. Educ. Pub. 75c.

You don't lose your interest. It tells how the Indians and the white men fought for land.

SIXTH GRADE

20. **BOBBSEY TWINS.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It tells about two sets of twins and about their home and adventures. It tells about the ghost that came at night.

21. **LITTLE MAID OF PROVINCETOWN.** Alice T. Curtis. Penn. \$1.50.

I like the part where the little girl threw some sand and water into the children's faces because they called her a spy.

22. **BOBBSEY TWINS AT SCHOOL.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

When Bart and some other boys were playing bat and ball the ball hit the window of an old man's house. The man gave the boys many things to play ball with.

23. **BOBBSEY TWINS ON BLUEBERRY ISLAND.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It is very interesting when the gypsies find them in their cave and their dog Snap rescues them.

24. **BOBBSEY TWINS AT SNOW LODGE.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

They found the money which old Mr. Crawford thought his nephew, Henry, took and hid.

25. **BOBBSEY TWINS ON A HOUSE BOAT.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

I like the part where they were at the water falls. They could go under the falls without getting wet.

26. **LITTLE MAID OF MASSACHUSETTS COLONY.** Alice T. Curtis. Penn. \$1.50.

Anne rescues her father and Captain Starkweather from the English boat.

27. **BOBBSEY TWINS AT THE SEASHORE.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It tells of the many experiences that they have had. Nelly's father is found and restored to Nelly and her mother.

28. **BOBBSEY TWINS AT MEADOW BROOK.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It told how they went camping. Flossie screamed when she saw a horse peer around the corner of the tent.

29. **BOBBSEY TWINS IN THE GREAT WEST.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

I like this book because the twins found the missing boys.

30. **BOBBSEY TWINS AT HOME.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

Flossie and Freddie found Tommy Todd's daddy who was lost at sea.

31. **BOBBSEY TWINS AND BABY MAY.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

A baby is found at their steps and after a time it is stolen again.

32. **BOBBSEY TWINS AT CEDAR CAMP.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

The part I like best is where Bert and Nan go nutting and get lost in a blizzard.

33. **BOBBSEY TWINS IN THE COUNTRY.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

I liked it best when Snoop was in the train. Freddie was frightened. Another part I like was where they were getting ready to go to Meadow Brook.

34. **BOBBSEY TWINS IN WASHINGTON.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It tells of the fun the Bobbsey twins had in Washington. They saw President Wilson. They recovered a china sugar bowl and creamer for an old lady.

35. **BOBBSEY TWINS AT THE COUNTY FAIR.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It was very exciting when the Bobbsey twins went up in a balloon. The part about Bob's guess was interesting.

36. **BOBBSEY TWINS CAMPING OUT.** Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It is so exciting. Freddie and Flossie get lost in such funny places but always get found.

37. BOBBSEY TWINS ON THE DEEP BLUE SEA. Laura L. Hope. Grosset. 60c.

It tells how the twins and their parents went to rescue a boy who was alone on an island.

38. MISS MINERVA AND WILLIAM GREENHILL. Frances B. Calhoun. Reilly.

It tells about a little boy who was very mean and he was sent to bed. Read this book and find out what his aunt did to him.

39. LITTLE MAID OF NARRAGANSETT BAY. Alice T. Curtis. Penn. \$1.50.

It's exciting to read about a little girl who saved Boston by taking a message in the night to a man's house.

40. LITTLE MAID OF OLD CONNECTICUT. Alice T. Curtis. Penn. \$1.50.

It is about a girl who saved her country by doing a little errand.

41. EDITHA'S BURGLAR. Frances H. Burnett. Page. 75c.

It is about a little girl who was willing to give up her things to a burglar. She asked him to "please burgle quietly."

42. GRANDPA'S LITTLE GIRLS AT SCHOOL. Alice T. Curtis. Penn. \$1.50.

The interesting part was when they ran away and came back because they saw all kinds of animals.

43. LAND OF OZ. L. Frank Baum. Reilly.

The interesting part was where the army of General Jinjur and her women captured the city of Emerald.

44. LITTLE MAID OF OLD NEW YORK. Alice T. Curtis. Penn. \$1.50.

I liked the part where the two children were out in the wood and the bad man made them go down into a tunnel.

45. ADVENTURES OF ELIZABETH ANN. Josephine Lawrence. Barse. 85c.

At the end of it, Elizabeth Ann's aunt found her ring, her uncle had his white elephant, and Elizabeth's aunt forgave Rosa.

46. MABEL'S MISHAP. Amy E. Blanchard. Jacobs.

This book is about a little girl who spoiled her father's oldest book and saved money enough to get another just like it.

(To be concluded in the March issue
with grades 7 and 8)

THE ELEMENTARY ENGLISH REVIEW FORTHCOMING ARTICLES—THE MARCH NUMBER

Tentative Table of Contents

Who Should Select the Reading for Children?

Walter Barnes

Fairmont State Normal School, Fairmont, W. Va.

Supplement to the Winnetka Graded Book List (Concluded)

Carleton Washburne and Mabel Vogel

Winnetka, Illinois

Oral and Written Composition Projects

Chicago Normal College

Personality and the New Education

Riah Cox

Indianapolis, Indiana

Teaching a Masterpiece in the Grammar Grades

Edith Anderson

Book Reviews

Clarissa Murdoch

NOTES ON THE WINNETKA SUPPLEMENT

BERTHA HATCH

Librarian, Cleveland School of Education

ANNIE SPENCER CUTTER

Director of School Department, Cleveland Public Library

THERE ARE 112 titles on the list of books which were excluded from the Winnetka Graded Book List by a vote of three-fourths or more of the committee of children's librarians because of low literary value or undesirable subject matter. Of these, 58 titles belong to series each containing from two to sixteen titles. Four authors only account for 29 more and the two Porters have contributed four. This leaves but 21 books which have any pretensions to individual style or incident. Typifying the poverty of interest to be found in the longest and most popular of the series represented, take "The Bobbsey Twins in a Great City." Disobedience or running away account for the nine chief episodes of the book! Flossie, the fat fairy, and Freddy the fat fireman run away only seven times. The outcome is much pleasurable excitement but no unpleasant consequences. The style has the flatness and monotony of a mediocre English theme.

An analysis of the children's own notes brings out the following elements of appeal:

- Excitement and superfluous action
- Mystery
- Sentimentality
- Mischief and practical jokes
- Accomplishment of the impossible by young people
- Happy and illogical ending
- Running away (mentioned five times)

Summed up these represent the wish fulfillment of day-dreaming. Which of these are legitimate appeals?

More desirable books link the fulfillment of wishes with plausibility in such ways as:

- Excitement if translated into possible adventure
- Mischief if translated into wholesome fun
- Sentimentality if translated into active idealism
- A happy ending, if logical

Books by Altsheler, Grinnell, and Hawes, to mention only a few, will furnish adventure and achievement in proportion to effort expended. Lofting, Lear, and Paine will supply fun but not slap-stick comedy. In "Little Women" and "Betty Leicester" there is wholesome sentiment and real idealism.

The trouble is not that there is a lack of wholesome and thoroughly interesting books to occupy all the time which any boy or girl should spend in reading, but children, if left to themselves, will follow the line of least resistance. The books on this list require no effort to read. They require no background since the setting is always familiar and they are devoid of atmosphere. The same plots, the same characters, the same environment regardless of country or time, are used again and again.

We may differ as to what constitutes literary merit, but we do recognize that the really good book for children does possess individuality.

Above all these undesirable titles are inexpensive and therefore easily procured.

The untutored person does not prefer the best in music, in art or in books. Good pictures, good music and good books must be supplied in quantity to develop appreciation.

If we listen to much good music, we prefer it to jazz; if we visit the great art gal-

leries, we come to appreciate the finest pictures instead of chromos, and if we read good books from childhood, we acquire discrimination in literary values.

In all these matters are we willing to accept the untutored judgment of the child as the sole criterion?

ORALIZATION

(Continued from Page 46)

will be judged, and that he can never express himself clearly and fully without meeting these standards: that the world will think better of him because of his conformity to them. Thirteen verbs, we are told, mastered, will solve the language problem in the grades. A long road to the end of them, though, and ours the job of devising ways, and means, and schemes whereby the child may finally "arrive."

There should be no stint of rewards given for speech improvement. One of these might be the sending out by twos, children to interview prominent citizens on interesting subjects, such interviews, later, to be reported to class and discussed. The object in sending two is that one may be a check upon the other. This plan has been tried with excellent effect. The exercise is good in various ways and has a stimulating effect. All sorts of student affairs are valuable aids in speech motivation: mornings in chapel; special errands

to the superintendent's or the principal's office; playground activities; special devices in "Better Speech Week"; the entertainment of one class by another; projects galore; "Evenings" when outside guests, usually mothers, are invited; these, and a thousand other enterprises that time, and occasion, and ingenuity may suggest are dear to the hearts of children. They love them and revel in them.

But always the big rewards, the ones most cherished and sought for, must go for speech improvement. The award must not be made on a basis of correctness alone, —to the happy child who, perchance, would speak better English were he never to go to school where he must hear bad and worse as well as good and best English. Reward the child who has made the most progress, for it is he who deserves the praise and the recognition from his group that so amply compensates effort in a socialized school.

EDITORIALS

Why Study the Winnetka Supplement?

THE children's comments in the Winnetka Supplement bring to mind a little girl who was developing a personal library with the co-operation of her parents and relatives. She had a large collection of books, and on every birthday, additions were made of new volumes of her own choice. Her parents always consulted her before selecting books for her library. The collection was much treasured by the little girl, and she read the books in it with the deepest enjoyment. She knew the books thoroughly, too, and derived great pleasure from every minute spent in reading from her library shelves.

But she said that she did not like the books that she had to read at school. It was very hard, she declared, for her to answer the questions her teacher asked about the reading she did there. She hated the book assignments her teacher made. Neither she nor her teacher understood each other on matters of reading. She knew, from the way her teacher talked, that the teacher had no real acquaintance with the Bobbsey Twins, nor with The Wizard of Oz. How could the teacher like books he had never seen, or understand how anyone else could like them? She and her teacher had no interests in common when it came to books.

And yet the home library was controlling the tastes and interests of the child. The teacher knew something was wrong. He did not know just what. A physician who made no better diagnosis of the causes of illness, and understood no better than this teacher the nature of the symptoms, would be helpless to relieve the ailment.

There are some very bad reading symptoms evident in the Winnetka Supplement.

Miss Annie Spencer Cutter, and Miss Bertha Hatch, page 53, point out some of these. They point out, too, that the children are widely exposed to the books which affect so disastrously their interests in reading.

Teachers are usually shocked when they learn what their children are reading out of school. They are shocked because they have permitted themselves to go uninformed. They know more of what children should read than they do of what children are reading. Worst of all, they know least about remedies which might prove effective in flagrant cases.

There are many reasons why teachers should study children's unprejudiced comments on books, and their preferences, such as are given in the Winnetka Supplement. A few of these are as follows:

1. What children really enjoy in reading affects their tastes more deeply than what they are told to enjoy in school.

2. The more undesirable the books are that the children habitually read, the greater the need for the teacher to acquaint himself with these books and their relationship to child psychology.

3. The more deeply the child is interested in trashy books, the more resentful he will feel at random thrusts from his teacher at books he likes.

4. No teacher can gain the real confidence of his children in reading matters, who is not well informed and sympathetic toward the reading which his children are doing outside of school.

5. As things have stood in the past, many teachers have been as ignorant of the trashy books that children read and of the reasons why the books are read as the children themselves are of standard literature.

REVIEWS AND ABSTRACTS

TOPSY TURVY TALES. By Mildred Batchelder. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons. 1926. 90 pages.

This is a pleasing little supplementary reader based upon the doings of Topsy Turvy, a merry black kitten belonging to a little girl. Learning to read will be a delightful process to the small child who pores over this book, for the author has selected as topics for the chapters subjects of greatest appeal to children—the cutting of a Christmas tree, a party, a play, and all through the book the delightful antics of Topsy Turvy.

—Clarissa Murdoch.

THE INDIAN CANOE. By Russell D. Smith. New York: The Century Co. 1925. 319 pages.

A good book for boys to read by the fireside next winter is this outdoor story by the fireside woods. It will bring vividly to mind the joys of the trail for emphasis is placed upon camping, fishing, and voyaging, although there is enough of a story to hold the interest.

—Clarissa Murdoch.

TREASURE HUNTER'S OF BOB'S HILL. By Charles Pierce Benton. New York: Henry Holt & Co. 1926. 286 pages.

This volume is the latest in the Bob's Hill Series. Boys of the gang age like these books because there is "something doing" every minute. The scene of this story is the Iron Range in Minnesota. The boys have remarkable experiences and they also learn something about iron mining.

—Clarissa Murdoch.

AT BOW VIEW. By Gladys Blake. New York: D. Appleton & Co. 1926. 252 pages.

Gladys Blake has written a sequel to *The Mysterious Tutor*. In this volume the mystery is solved. The six children who lived on the old plantation, Bow View, are a lively set. The author, a Southerner, sympathetically describes the life lived on a prosperous plantation.

—Clarissa Murdoch.

SOLDIER BOY. By Felicite Lefevre. Pictures by Tony Sarg. N. Y. Greenberg. 1926.

The story of Tommy, who wanted to be, and was a soldier, will be received with chuckles of delight by small readers, and Tony Sarg's bright pictures will add their own bubbling merriment. The type is so clear and large, and the type page so carefully limited that young readers may read most

of the story for themselves, with a little help over the hard words.

Soldier Boy is one of the rarely excellent books for very small children.

—J. M.

THE TREASURE SHIP. A book of prose and verse edited by Lady Cynthia Asquith. N. Y., Charles Scribner's Sons. 1926.

This book contains stories by John Galsworthy, J. M. Barrie, Hilaire Belloc, Compton Mackenzie, Viscountess Grey of Falloden, and many other ponderous names of English literature. It must be admitted, however, that the stories and verses appearing in this book could hardly have brought their authors the celebrity they enjoy, and that the volume is more impressive as a collection of names than as a collection of materials.

Most of the stories are concerned with matters of little interest to American children, and are marred by frequent moralizing and occasional stuffy adult pedantry.

—J. M.

EVERYMAN'S LIBRARY. London, J. M. Dent; New York, E. P. Dutton.

It is a temptation, into which many writers and more speakers fall, to praise what is beyond praise, and to eulogize what is already universally revered. Thousands of orators, no doubt, have lashed their imaginations for new compliments to George Washington, or to the Constitution of the United States.

The same difficulty besets a reviewer confronted with new volumes of *Everyman's Library*, for its importance among publisher's series and its benefit to the reading public make it constantly a subject for praise.

A number of volumes have recently been added, some of which are for children. Among recent publications are: *The Complete Poems of Robert Louis Stevenson*, *South Sea Tales*, by Stevenson, *Madam How and Lady Why*, by Kingsley, *Waterman's Journeys in South America*, *Five Weeks in a Balloon* and *Around the World in Eighty Days*, by Jules Verne, *Peaks, Passes and Glaciers*, selected and annotated by E. H. Blakeney, the *Letters of Horace Walpole*, the letters of William Cowper, *Memoirs of Sir Thomas Buxton*, and *Voltaire's Age of Louis XIV.*

—D. B.